

CABINET

16th July 2019

RUTLAND COUNTY MUSEUM & COTTAGE ROOF WORKS

Report of the Strategic Director for Places

Strategic Aim:	Sustainable Growth	
Key Decision: Yes	Forward Plan Reference: FP/240519	
Reason for Urgency:	N/A	
Exempt Information	No	
Cabinet Member(s) Responsible:	Mr G Brown, Deputy Leader and Portfolio Holder for Planning, Environment, Property and Finance.	
Contact Officer(s):	Christine Traill- Strategic Director of Places	01572 758426 ctrail@Rutland.gov.uk
	Andrew Edwards, Head of Property Services	01572 758391 aedwards@rutland.gov.uk

DECISION RECOMMENDATIONS

That Cabinet:

1. Approves the release of up to £86,750 of (which includes £10,410 contingency and £6,940 of management costs) of Capital Receipts to replace the roof at Rutland County Museum and Catmose Cottage during summer 2019.
2. Approves the appointment of A J Bryan Construction Ltd. for the sum of £69,400 to repair and replace the roof at Rutland County Museum and Catmose Cottage.
3. Authorises the Head of Property Services to commit the contingency of up to £10,410 to cover additional expenses that could arise as a result of the project.

1 PURPOSE OF THE REPORT

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to obtain authority from Cabinet to release up to £86,750 of Capital Receipts and the appointment of A J Bryan Construction Ltd for the contract sum of £69,400 to allow the repair/replacement of major components of the museum roof.

2 BACKGROUND AND MAIN CONSIDERATIONS

- 2.1 On the 16th October 2018 (Report No.181/2018) Cabinet delegated authority to the Head of Property Services and The Portfolio Holder for Property to issue tenders for the repair and replacement of the roof at Rutland County Museum and Catmose Cottage.
- 2.2 Following approval from Cabinet further work was undertaken to fully ascertain the scope of the works. After a full appraisal of the works it became clear that the majority of leaks were confined to the central valley. Whilst there were occasional leaks elsewhere their extent could not justify a complete replacement of the roof.
- 2.3 This revised scope formed the basis of the tender documents issued on the 10th May 2019, with tenders being received on the 7th June 2019.

3 PROGRAMME

- 3.1 To prevent further damage to the roof, works will be completed in summer 2019. A full programme of works will be determined when the contractor is engaged.
- 3.2 It is anticipated the contractor will be on site for 6 weeks to complete the work.

4 TENDER EVALUATION AND PROPOSAL

- 4.1 A total of 4 tenders ranging in value of between £58,431 and £87,988 were returned. They were evaluated using the Welland Procurement tender evaluation schedule (an evaluation panel of 3 team members, along with support from Welland Procurement carried out the assessment). The technical assessment is set out in the table below.

Question	Max. Score	Bidder Score			
		Bidder 1	Bidder 2	Bidder 3	Bidder 4
Understanding of Contract Documentation	10	5	7	2	3
Method Statement	10	6	6	2	3
Health and Safety	10	6	6	2	2
Work Programme	10	6	5	2	2
Workforce (key personnel)	10	5	6	1	1

- 4.2 In assessing the technical proposals from the contractors the quality of the submission is assessed. Where a technical bid fails to meet an acceptable standard it is discounted. Scores of less than 5 indicated that the response is below expectations. Both bidders 3 and 4 submitted bids that fell far short of the required standard with one in particular failing to demonstrate, via a credit check, suitable financial stability. Due to their inability to meet the technical requirements both were discounted.

4.3 A financial assessment was then carried out. This considered the bids submitted and included a review of the costs and an arithmetical check. The tenders received from the compliant bidders are set out below:

Bidder 1: £69,400

Bidder 2: £82,988

4.4 In accordance with good practice the proposal is weighted. 70% of the marks are allocated to the tender costs and 30% to the technical proposals. When this weighting is taken into account the bids are as follows:

Bidder 1: 71.48%

Bidder 2: 67.79%

4.5 Due diligence was carried out on the tender including the suitability and quality submissions, and a winning bidder has been identified. The proposal is to award the contract to A J Bryan Construction Ltd (Bidder 1) for the tendered sum of £69,400 excluding contingencies of £10,410 and management costs of £6,940.

5 CONSULTATION

5.1 Consultation has taken place internally with Senior Officers and Elected Members of the Council.

5.2 This has included planning colleagues to ensure any issues surrounding a Grade II listed building are included in the project costs.

6 ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS

6.1 Do nothing and continue to fund urgent repairs as required, incurring additional costs. Replacing the roof is inevitable at some stage and in the last 3 years in excess of £13K has been invested in repairing various leaks. Continuing with this approach could rapidly become a false economy and any repair costs are better invested in replacing the roof completely, negating the potential need for additional repairs in future years.

6.2 Cabinet could also choose to use a different funding source as set out in para 7.1.

7 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 The Council has uncommitted Capital Receipts of c£96k which is the preferred method of funding. The Council has looked into funding alternatives, but Capital Receipts is deemed to be the most suitable. The other funding options considered and the reason for not using them are:

- Section 106 – the Council is not holding sufficient suitable section 106 funding to complete the works.
- Revenue Funding – Not considered due to the position on the Councils MTFP.

- Prudential Borrowing – This method is feasible, however would incur a revenue pressure of c£4k per annum to cover the cost of borrowing and lost investment income.
- Oakham North Agreement – Could be used, but has more flexibility than Capital Receipts

7.2 The project contains c15% contingency, which is sufficient for a project of this size. The risk of major price movements has been mitigated further by the approach taken in moving the project forward, as covered in section 2 of this report.

7.3 As mentioned in para 6.1 the Council spent £13k last financial year on repairing the roof. If this trend continues then project would have a payback period of 7 years.

8 LEGAL AND GOVERNANCE CONSIDERATIONS

8.1 The works were procured in accordance with Contract Standing Orders and therefore, there are no legal or governance implications.

9 DATA PROTECTION IMPLICATIONS

9.1 A Data Protection Impact Assessments (DPIA) has not been completed for the following reason: This report only requests approval for the release of funding so an assessment is not required in this case.

10 EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

10.1 This report seeks approval for the establishment of award criteria and the issue of tender documents. There is no requirement for an EIA.

11 COMMUNITY SAFETY IMPLICATIONS

11.1 There are no Community Safety implications.

12 HEALTH AND WELLBEING IMPLICATIONS

12.1 There are no Health and Wellbeing implications.

13 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

13.1 Environmental implications – There are no Environmental implications.

14 HUMAN RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

14.1 There are no Human Resource implications

15 PROCUREMENT IMPLICATIONS

15.1 There are no Procurement implications.

16 SOCIAL VALUE IMPLICATIONS

16.1 The low value of this procurement means it has attracted bids from regional Small to Medium Enterprises.

17 CONCLUSION AND SUMMARY OF REASONS FOR THE RECOMMENDATIONS

17.1 The recommendations set out in this report will ensure the roof is replaced where necessary with little, if any, impact on the operations of the Council.

18 APPENDICES

18.1 None

A Large Print or Braille Version of this Report is available upon request – Contact 01572 722577.